

**To:** Cogliano, Vincent[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis[DAmico.Louis@epa.gov]; Ross, Mary[Ross.Mary@epa.gov]  
**From:** Flowers, Lynn  
**Sent:** Wed 3/4/2015 7:32:25 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Clearance of Revised Characteristics of Carcinogens Paper

Vince: I have read the paper and really like it. Adopting this method for evaluating mechanistic cancer data seems to be a very good idea.

I caught the "balanced review article" text in Step 2 and see that you already alerted Marty Smith to that.

I see two typo-type items that I will point out and that's it!

## **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

Lynn Flowers, PhD, DABT  
Associate Director for Health  
National Center for Environmental Assessment  
US EPA  
Washington, DC  
703-347-8537

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Cogliano, Vincent  
**Sent:** Monday, March 02, 2015 2:35 PM  
**To:** Flowers, Lynn  
**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis; Ross, Mary  
**Subject:** RE: Clearance of Revised Characteristics of Carcinogens Paper

OK, I'll ask Martyn to wait a few more days. The most recent revision is attached. I'll send him my edits now, cc'ing you all -- Vince

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Flowers, Lynn  
**Sent:** Monday, March 02, 2015 2:31 PM  
**To:** Cogliano, Vincent  
**Cc:** D'Amico, Louis; Ross, Mary  
**Subject:** Re: Clearance of Revised Characteristics of Carcinogens Paper

Can you give me a couple of days to finish out NCEA clearance? I unfortunately left a copy in my office was and can't access. Mary has to clear too, I cced her here!

Sent from my iPhone

On Mar 2, 2015, at 2:23 PM, Cogliano, Vincent <cogliano.vincent@epa.gov> wrote:

Hello – Can I tell Martyn Smith that this paper is OK to submit? Bob Kavlock has already given comments and I have a few edits to send when I give Martyn the go-ahead ... Thanks! – Vince

**From:** Martyn Smith [mailto:martynts@berkeley.edu]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 26, 2015 9:33 AM  
**To:** Cogliano, Vincent  
**Subject:** Fwd: Revised Characteristics of Carcinogens Paper

Hi Vince

Is EPA ready for me to submit early next week?

Thanks Martyn

Begin forwarded message:

From: Kurt Straif <StraifK@iarc.fr<mailto:StraifK@iarc.fr>>  
Date: February 26, 2015 at 5:03:10 AM PST  
To: Martyn Smith <martynts@berkeley.edu<mailto:martynts@berkeley.edu>>  
Cc: Kathryn Guyton <GuytonK@iarc.fr<mailto:GuytonK@iarc.fr>>  
Subject: RE: Revised Characteristics of Carcinogens Paper Dear Martyn,

The manuscript has been cleared for submission by IARC.

Kurt

From: Martyn Smith [mailto:martynts@berkeley.edu]  
Sent: 20 February 2015 20:40  
To: Paul Lambert; DeMarini, David; Kavlock, Robert; Coglian, Vincent; bucher@niehs.nih.gov<mailto:bucher@niehs.nih.gov>; Chris Portier; Caldwell, Jane; Gibbons, Catherine; Kathryn Guyton; Fritz, Jason; iir@unc.edu<mailto:iir@unc.edu>; lambert@oncology.wisc.edu<mailto:lambert@oncology.wisc.edu>; hecht002@umn.edu<mailto:hecht002@umn.edu>; Robert Baan; Kurt Straif; Rusyn, Ivan  
Cc: Martyn Smith  
Subject: Revised Characteristics of Carcinogens Paper

Dear all

I have incorporated the helpful comments of John, Kurt, Ivan, Jason, David, Bob, Paul and Robert into the essentially final version of the paper. I have added to the legend of Figure 3 but could use some help in making it better. I have also asked Ivan to help me with the receptor characteristic description. The paper is currently slightly too long at 5,213 words and so I may edit it further once I have received comments on the paper from the internal review at EPA and IARC.

Please add any conflicts of interest and grant support. Kurt has provided me with names to acknowledge in the working group. If I do not hear from you I will assume you are ok with everything and have nothing to add.

The attached version of the paper dated 2-20-15 has all the changes accepted. The 2-18-15 version shows almost all the tracked changes.

Hoping to get this out the door soon. Thanks for all your help,

Martyn

Martyn T. Smith, Ph.D.  
Professor & Director, Superfund Research Program Division of Environmental Health Sciences School of Public Health Li Ka Shing Center, Rm 386 University of California Berkeley, California 94720-7356  
(510) 642-8770 tel / (510) 642-0427 fax  
(510) 334-1222 (cell)  
(510) 643-5100 (assistant)  
email: martynts@berkeley.edu<mailto:martynts@berkeley.edu>

<Key Characteristics of Carcinogens\_2-20-15.docx>